

DRAFT
PLANNING COMMITTEE MEETING
held at 8.00pm on Thursday 26th April 2018
Small Hall, Claygate Village Hall

Present: Councillors Geoff Herbert (Chairman), Julian Way, John Bamford and Ken Huddart.
Co-opted: Tom Swift
Members of the public: Mrs Diana Hodshon
In attendance: Shirley Round (Parish Clerk & RFO).

1. **Apologies for absence:** None

2. **Declarations of Interest in items on the Agenda.**

Cllr Geoff Herbert	Co-ordinator of Neighbourhood Watch, Member of Claygate Flower and Village Show Committee
Cllr John Bamford	Chairman of Friends of Capelfield Surgery, Trustee of Friends of Claygate Day Centre, Trustee of CVHA, Bookkeeper at Holy Name Church, Esher
Cllr Ken Huddart	Chairman of the Claygate Conservation Areas Advisory Committee, Traffic Engineering Consultant, Fellow of Chartered Institution of Highways & Transportation, Fellow of Institution of Engineering & Technology, Fellow of Institution of Civil Engineers.
Cllr Julian Way	Undertakes care work Sans Soucie, Guildford, Member of Kingston Chess Club, Supervisor at Kingston Contact Centre. Trustee Claygate Recreation Ground Trust.
Tom Swift	Resident of Hermitage Close

3. **To confirm the Minutes of the last meeting**

The Minutes of the meeting on 5th April 2018 were agreed and signed by the Chairman

4. **To report on the actioning of items from previous Minutes.**

AP 27 2017/0009 Laxton House Hill View Road. DONE

AP28 The Revised Draft National Planning Policy Framework response. See Agenda item 8.
DONE

Cllr Herbert requested a change in the order of the Agenda to discuss Planning Application 2018/1013. This was unanimously agreed.

2018/1013 43 Old Claygate Lane – two storey side extension, single storey rear extension and rear terrace following demolition of existing side buildings.

Mrs Hodshon explained the reasons behind the alteration to the house. Due to ill health she had been advised she should not live alone. Her daughter and family agreed to move into the house and the alterations would enable Mrs. Hodshon to maintain privacy and independence. This is a revised plan which had acknowledged the criticisms of the previous Application.

7.11 2018/1013 43 Old Claygate Lane – two-storey side extension, single storey rear extension and rear terrace following demolition of existing side outbuildings.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

5. Planning correspondence and outstanding results.

i) 2017/0009 Laxton House Hill View Road: The Clerk wrote to Mr. Brooks (EBC Planning Department) confirming the Parish Council's objection to the application.

6. To discuss and comment on applications decided since the last meeting.

A report from Cllr Bamford was circulated prior to the meeting. See Appendix A.

7. Applications from EBC weekly lists including confirmation of comments sent to EBC

Week ending 6th April

7.1 2018/0784 20 Gordon Road – single-storey side/rear extension, single-storey front extension, roof extension, roof lights, alterations to porch, new chimney, flue, new vehicular access and hard standing, raised patio and alterations to fenestration following partial demolition of the existing house and demolition of the existing rear outbuilding.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed

7.2 2018/0887 Vellacotts 11 Beaconsfield Road – Claygate Foley Estate Conservation Area – fell 1 x Indian bean. The application is to fell the tree as it is too dominant.

Claygate Parish Council: No comment. Unanimously agreed

7.3 2018/0824 95 Coverts Road – part two/part single storey rear extension and new front porch following demolition of existing rear projection.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Claygate Parish Council note the removal of tree T2 and are conscious that tree T1 appears to be relatively close to the extension and are therefore concerned about root protection. It is also noted that the 2 species of trees have not been identified. Unanimously agreed.

7.4 2018/0561 1 Ruxley Towers, Ruxley Ridge – listed building consent: flagpole on roof terrace.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

Cllr John Bamford and Tom Swift declared they were residents of Hermitage Close

7.5 2018/0795 2 Hermitage Close – single storey side/read extension

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

7.6 2018/0865 88 Foley Road – rear outbuilding.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

Week ending 13th April

7.7 2018/0894 5 Bridle Road – singly-storey rear extension, front porch, roof extension, rear dormer window incorporating Juliet balcony, front and rear rooflights and rear raised patio following removal of existing chimney.

Claygate Parish Council: Object. Claygate Parish Council considers this application does not comply with EBC Development Management Plan DM2. It is over dominant due to mass and scale. Unanimously agreed.

7.8 2018/0994 46 Foley Road – non-material amendments to planning permission 2017/0339 to amend roof layout.

Claygate Parish Council: No comment.

Cllr John Bamford declared a non-pecuniary interest and did not take part in the discussion on the following application.

7.9 2018/0962 6 Merrilyn Close – single storey rear extension, new entrance portico and conversion of garage into living space, with external alterations following demolition of existing conservatory.

Claygate Parish Council: No comment. Claygate Parish Council note the planning statement does not match the application in relation to the brick work and the roof. Unanimously agreed.

7.10 2018/0995 1 Stevens Lane – roof extension incorporating a 0.5m increase in ridge height, side and rear dormer windows and front rooflights.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

7.11 Discussed at the beginning of the meeting.

7.12 2018/0944 9 Kilnside – single storey front extension.

Claygate Parish Council: Object. Claygate Parish Council considers this application does not comply with EBC Development Management Plan DM2. The front extension is forward of the building line. Unanimously agreed.

W/ending 20th April

7.13 2018/1080 109 Hare Lane – variation of condition 2 (approved plans) of planning permission 2016/1091 (extensions to provide 9 flats) to amend internal layout of flats with changes to fenestration and reconfiguration of main entrance and internal staircase.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Claygate Parish Council note with concern that there is no indication as to where the door to the bin/cycle store is located. Unanimously agreed

7.14 2018/1074 2 Sydney Cottages, The Green – single storey rear extension, rear dormer window and front roof lights following partial demolition of the existing property.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Claygate Parish Council requests a Construction Management Plan to ensure that Elm Road is kept clear for access to important local services ie Claygate Centre and Capelfield GP Surgery. Unanimously agreed.

7.15 2018/1071 26 The Avenue – Additional detached single storey house with rooms in the roof space and dormer windows following part demolition of existing house and garage.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

7.16 2018/1069 27 Woodbourne Drive – single storey rear/side extension and a new side access gate.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

7.17 2018/0980 9 Beaconsfield Road – Claygate Foley Estate Conservation Area – crown reduce 1 x T1 Strawberry by approx 1-2m, 1 x T2 Lime by approx 2-2.5m and 1 x T3 Holly by approx 2m.

Claygate Parish Council.

Mature Strawberry Tree – no comment. Unanimously agreed

Mature Holly Tree – no comment. Unanimously agreed.

Mature Lime Tree – Objection to some of the work. Unanimously agreed.

This beautiful tree is highly visible and very important to the street scene, making a positive contribution to the area's amenity.

Particularly relevant here is the recent Appeal Decision dated 11 April 2018 re Holm Oak at Baringa, 16 Beaconsfield Road. APP/TPO/K3605/6387

In this case the Inspector upheld the Council's refusal for work on the tree on the grounds that the proposed work would affect the appearance and amenity value of the tree and would be likely to affect its health.

We do not object to the removal of the lower limb over the neighbouring driveway, and we would agree to a small reduction to the remaining spread of the tree, max 1.5-2 metres, in order to balance it.

We object to any reduction in the height of the remainder of the tree on the grounds that it would adversely affect the shape and appearance of the tree, and we do not think that this work is necessary.

7.18 2018/1089 27 St. Leonards Road – part single/part two storey side/front extension, single storey rear extension and front dormer window following demolition of existing garage.

Claygate Parish Council – No objection. Unanimously agreed.

9.45pm Cllr. Julian Way left the meeting.

8. Draft National Planning Framework response.

Cllr Bamford provided draft responses to the questions which were unanimously agreed by the Planning Committee members. It was agreed to circulate these responses to all Councillors before submission. The Clerk will request that any additional comments be submitted to her no later than Sunday 6th May. The response to this document will be completed and submitted on Monday 7th May (final submission required by 9th May). **AP29**

9. Report on the East Area Sub-Committee Meeting

2017/4157 5 Foley Road. Detached two storey house with entrance gates and boundary fencing to a max. height of 1m following demolition of existing house. Claygate Parish Council had no objection to this Application which was Permitted by the East Area Sub-Committee on 23rd April.

10. Licensing applications

There are no new applications in Claygate.

11. Enforcement issues

There was nothing to report on the outstanding issues. The Planning Committee will continue their observations and report to EBC Planning.

12. Communication of key decisions to residents including input to Courier and the website.

Copy date for the next edition is 27th April. The result of a recent Inspectorate's report is a possibility.

13. Matters for Information Purposes Only.

Nothing to report.

**14. To confirm the date of the next meeting and attendance of members of Planning Committee:
Thursday 17th May 2018**

15. Elmbridge East Area Planning Committee:

Monday 14th May 2018 – Tom Swift to attend

The meeting closed at 10.20 pm

Chairman:

Dated:

Reserve for the next meeting Cllr Mark Sugden

Appendix A

Planning Applications Decided for weeks ending 4, 11 & 20 April

15 Applications were decided.

These included 1 LDCs, 1 Non Material Amendment & 1 Confirmation of Compliance where there is limited scope for Planning to comment or object.

Planning Committee agreed with EBC on 13 decisions.

The Applications where we did not agree were:-

2017/4129: 7 Oaken Lane Claygate Esher Surrey KT10 ORG

Two-storey side extension following partial demolition of existing house.

CPC did not object but submitted several comments. EBC refused on the grounds that it would harm the character of the area and street scene as it

- would unbalance the symmetry of the entrance to Derwent Close
- dominate the entrance to/from Derwent Close due to the scale, bulk, height and mass in close proximity to the side boundary

2018/0260: 10 Ruxley Ridge Claygate Esher Surrey KT10 OHZ

First floor side extension, front porch and increase in ridge height by 1.53 metres incorporating front and rear dormer windows.

CPC did not object but noted that pre-planning advice had not been published on the website.

EBC refused on the grounds that the proposed development by virtue of its size, scale, design, bulk, mass, siting and appearance would result in a dominant, unsympathetic and incongruous form of development that would unacceptably harm the overall appearance, form and proportion of the host building and would adversely impact on the setting, character and appearance of the area and street scene.

(NB: Pre-application advice on a different scheme that included a single storey rear extension and alterations to the roof to create a mansard roof comprising front and rear dormers concluded that this scheme was unlikely to be acceptable due to the design of the mansard roof).

Appeals Lodged and/or Decided since last Planning Committee Meeting

2 Appeals were decided

2016/2062 Land South of Common Lane/Ruxley Ridge Esher

Retention of existing field shelters to create one structure

The Appeal was "against a failure to give notice within the prescribed period of a decision on an application for planning permission".

This Appeal was lodged after East Area Planning Subcommittee (EAPS) reviewed the Application but before Planning Committee met to decide it. EAPS recommended that permission was granted, but with three conditions, one of which was a time restriction of 9 months.

The Appeal granted planning permission for the two field shelters subject to the first two conditions recommended by EAPS, thereby excluding any time restrictions.

The Inspector determined that "The development is not inappropriate and Green Belt openness would be preserved. The proposal would therefore accord with the Green Belt protection aims of Policy DM17 of the DMP and paragraph 89 of the Framework". The Appeal's judgement went on to say "Whilst I note the evidence relating to the health of the horses kept on the appeal site, as I have found no harm to the Green Belt I do not need to consider whether very special circumstances exist".

2017/1994 Baringa 16 Beaconsfield Road Claygate Esher Surrey KT10 OPW

Tree Preservation Order EL: 94/11 - crown reduce 1 x holm oak (see application online for full details)

The Appeal against refusal of the proposed works on the tree was upheld on the grounds that the proposed works would reduce the amenity value of the tree and be detrimental to the tree's health