

**DRAFT**  
**PLANNING COMMITTEE MEETING**  
**Held at 8.00pm on Thursday 19<sup>th</sup> October 2017**  
**Committee Room, Claygate Village Hall**

*Prior to commencing the Meeting it was unanimously agreed that in the absence of the Parish Clerk Agenda Item 7 (Planning Applications) notes would be taken by Co-opted Committee Member Tom Swift and notes on the remainder of the Agenda items would be taken by Cllr John Bamford.*

Present: Councillors Geoff Herbert (Chairman), John Bamford, Ken Huddart, Mark Sugden, and Julian Way.  
Co-opted: Tom Swift  
Members of the Public: Mr J. Simpkins

1. **Apologies for absence:** Shirley Round (Parish Clerk & RFO) with reason.

2. **Declarations of Interest in items on the Agenda.**

Cllr Geoff Herbert	Co-ordinator of Neighbourhood Watch, Member of Claygate Flower and Village Show Committee
Cllr John Bamford	Chairman of Friends of Capelfield Surgery, Trustee of Friends of Claygate Day Centre, Trustee of CVHA, Bookkeeper at Holy Name Church, Esher
Cllr Ken Huddart	Chairman of Trustees of CVHA, Presidents of CVA and Acting Chairman of the Claygate Conservation Areas Advisory Committee, Traffic Engineering Consultant, Fellow of Chartered Institution of Highways & Transportation, Fellow of Institution of Engineering & Technology, Fellow of Institution of Civil Engineers.
Cllr Mark Sugden	Trustee of Claygate Village Hall Association, Committee member Claygate Village Association, Committee member Claygate Gardening Society, Chairman, Outreach Group, Church of the Holy Name, Esher
Cllr Julian Way	Undertakes care work Sans Soucie, Guildford, Member of Kingston Chess Club, Supervisor at Kingston Contact Centre. Trustee Claygate Recreation Ground Trust.
Tom Swift	Resident of Hermitage Close

3. **To confirm the Minutes of the last meeting**

The Minutes of the meeting on 28<sup>th</sup> September 2017 were agreed and signed by the Chairman subject to one amendment to record that Cllr Bamford had presented his apologies for absence.

*Cllr Herbert requested a change in the order of the Agenda to discuss Planning Application 2017/2863. This was unanimously agreed.*

**2017/2863 127 Hare Lane** - Part two/part single-storey rear extension.

Jonathan Simpkins, the Applicant explained that he had consulted with his immediate neighbour at No 125 about this application and his neighbour is fully supportive. He stated that No 125 is planning a comparable rear extension that will ensure that his plans will not breach the 45 degree rule.

Mr Simpkins then left the meeting before the Committee discussed the application

**7.2 2017/3007 2863 127 Hare Lane -**

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Request officer to check 45 degree rule from 125 Hare Lane. We note the garden length is less than the recommended minimum. Unanimously agreed.

**4. To report on the actioning of items from previous Minutes and agree any further action.**

AP12: see Item 9

AP13: see Item8.

**5. To receive Planning correspondence and outstanding results and agree action if necessary**

i) Email from Mr. Thorne regarding 2017/3007, the application for retrospective permission to erect a temporary structure at the Youth Centre, Elm Road.

ii) Email from Noel Carruthers regarding 2017/3239, the application for 2 Rythe Road.

iii) Email from Kingston Borough Council on 16<sup>th</sup> October regarding their Local Plan.

It was agreed that an update on Local Plans for Elmbridge and Kingston Borough Councils should be included as Agenda items for the foreseeable future.

**AP14.** Clerk to schedule these items in future Planning Committee meetings.

**6. To discuss and comment on applications decided since the last meeting.**

A report from Cllr Bamford was circulated prior to the meeting. See Appendix A

**7. Applications from EBC weekly lists including confirmation of comments sent to EBC**

**W/ending 29<sup>th</sup> September**

**7.1 2017/2854 28A The Parade - Rear dormer window and front roof lights..**

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

**7.2 2017/2869 127 Hare Lane – Part two/part single-storey rear extension.**

See previous page

**7.3 2017/3106 Glenavon House, 39 Common Road – Deed of Variation to planning permission 2017/0316 to alter Unilateral Undertaking Contribution.**

Cllr Bamford declared that he knew the Applicant.

Claygate Parish Council: No comment. Unanimously agreed.

**7.4 2017/3099 65 Foley Road – Single-storey side and rear extension with room over following demolition of existing garage.**

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

**W/ending 5<sup>th</sup> October**

**7.5 2017/2673 18 Foley Road – Roof extension with rooms in roof space incorporating rear dormer window and front roof light.**

Claygate Parish Council: No objection though we feel the dormer is disproportionate to the size of the host dwelling. Unanimously agreed.

**7.6 2017/3055 27 Crediton Way – Lawful Development Certificate: whether planning permission is required for an existing conversion of garage into living space.**

Claygate Parish Council: No objections. We note the ‘granny annexe’ is designed in such a way to become a separate dwelling as there is no access to the main building. Unanimously agreed.

**7.7 2017/3007 Claygate Youth Centre, Elm Road – retention of detached outbuilding including a proposed timber enclosure.**

Claygate Parish Council: Object. It does not enhance a locally listed building in a Conservation Area and so contravenes Policy DM12a and Policy DM2. We note that the Application form

correctly certifies the legal owner as Surrey County Council. However, the address given is for the Civic Centre, Esher. Unanimously agreed.

- 7.8 2017/3004 49 Foley Road** – Tress Preservation Order ESH:33 – 1 x Oak – remove epicormic growth.

Claygate Parish Council – no objection. Unanimously agreed.

- 7.9 2017/3142 17 Dalmore Avenue** – Rear dormer window and front roof lights.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

- 7.10 2017/3079 3 Claremont Road** – Claygate Foley Estate Conservation Area – fell 1 x Acacia.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection though we ask for a suitable replacement to be planted. Unanimously agreed.

- 7.11 2017/3145 4 Stevens Lane** – Confirmation of Compliance with Condition 5 (Tree inspection and Pre-commencement inspection) of planning permission 2016/2469.

Claygate Parish Council: No comment. Unanimously agreed.

*It is noted, prior to discussing application 2017/3153, that Councillors Geoff Herbert, Mark Sugden, John Bamford and Julian Way declared they knew the resident of 2B Torrington Close, who is a Parish Councillor, and that a co-opted member of the Planning Committee is also a member of Torrington Road Residents' Association and a Tree Warden.*

- 7.12 2017/3153 2B Torrington Close** – Tree Preservation Order EL:97/28 – Fell

Claygate Parish Council: No objection but we request replanting with a significant species which contributes similarly to the street scene. Unanimously agreed.

- 7.13 2017/3095 Ruxley Mount, Mountview Road** – Variation of Condition 2 (Approved Plans) of planning permission 2017/1564 to alter fenestration and external ground level.

Claygate Parish Council: No comment. Unanimously agreed.

#### **W/ending 12<sup>th</sup> October**

- 7.14 2017/2930 19-21 The Parade** – Air extraction unit.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

- 7.15 2017/3124 66 Stevens Lane** – Single storey side extension.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

- 7.16 2017/3218 129 Hare Lane** – Confirmation of Compliance with Condition 5 (Additional tree information and pre-commencement inspection) of planning permission 2017/1475.

Claygate Parish Council: No comment. Unanimously agreed.

- 7.17 2017/3239 2 Rythe Road** – Part two/part single-storey rear and single-storey side extensions and hard surfacing to provide 2 parking spaces following demolition of existing rear and side projections.

Claygate Parish Council: Objection. The application contravenes Policy DM6, especially 6a and d. We object to the reduction in canopy of T3, the reduction to the primary limb to T4, the reduction in canopy and radial spreads to T5 and T6. We also note the contrived nature of the flat roof design at the first floor junction with 4 Rythe Road. Unanimously agreed.

- 7.18 2017/3223 2 Gordon Road** – Non material amendment to planning permission 2015/2806 (House extensions) to alter the external finish from brick to a light beige/sand colour render.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

- 7.19 2017/3264 37 Hare Lane** – Confirmation of Compliance with Conditions: 4 (Additional tree information) and 5 (Tree protection) of planning permission 2017/1978.

Claygate Parish Council: We note that condition 5 of the Application applies for 5 years from first occupation of the development.

- 7.20 2017/3161..42 Oaken Lane** – single storey side and rear extension, part conversion of garage into living space and alterations to fenestration following demolition of existing rear extension.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

- 7.21 2017/3274 1 Bridle Road** – single storey side/front extension, rear decking and alterations to fenestration following partial demolition of existing single storey front/side projection.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

**7.22 2017/3257 113 Hare Lane** – single storey side extension and basement to existing garage.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. However, we have concerns about subsidence to the entrance and exit of Torrington Lodge public car park.

If the application is approved, we request the following:

- 1) A construction plan in advance of any development to be agreed with EBC
- 2) Arboricultural impact assessment report of 6/10/17 must be completely adhered to.

Unanimously agreed.

**7.23 2017/3254 5 Tower Gardens** – Tree preservation order EL:89/25 0 crown reduce 1 x horse chestnut.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

**7.24 2017/3277 Glen Alva, The Green** – Claygate Village Conservation Area – reduce height of 1 x cherry at the back garden.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

*It is noted, prior to discussion on application 2017/3220, that Cllrs Mark Sugden and Julian Way declared that they knew the Applicant.*

**7.25 2017/3220 Vale Farm Cottage, Vale Road** – Two storey front extension, part two/part single storey rear extension and conversion of garage into living space with external alterations.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection but we request removal of Permitted Development Rights if the application is approved. Unanimously approved.

**8. To discuss and agree Budget for 2018/19 to report to Council on 16<sup>th</sup> November**

Cllr Herbert reported that he had discussed a Budget for Planning for 2018/19 with the Clerk.

However, the specific details were not available for the Committee to agree. Cllr Sugden reported that all Committee Budgets must be agreed and submitted to the Clerk by 31<sup>st</sup> October and presented at the next Full Council meeting in November. Consequently, this item cannot be deferred to the next Planning meeting in November. It was agreed that Cllr Herbert would circulate the Planning Budget to Committee members by email for their approval.

**AP15.** Cllr Herbert to circulate a recommended 2018/19 Planning Budget to Cllrs Bamford, Huddart and Way before 31<sup>st</sup> October for their approval; submit the approved recommended Budget to the Clerk by 31<sup>st</sup> October and present it to Full Council on 16th November.

**9. To discuss and comment upon Department of Communities and Local Government's Consultation Proposals for Fixing The Broken Housing Market**

Cllr Herbert reported that Cllr Bamford had sent him a draft report that provided proposed answers to this Consultation. Cllr Herbert has reviewed this draft report and plans to make some changes and additions to it and circulate it to Committee members within the next week. The Consultation must be submitted by 9<sup>th</sup> November. As a result, this item cannot be deferred to the next Planning meeting on 9<sup>th</sup> November. It was agreed that Cllr Herbert would make his amendments and circulate the proposed response to the Consultation to Committee members and the Parish Council Chairman by email for their comments. The response to the Consultation, once agreed, should be sent to the Clerk for submission.

**AP16.** Cllr Herbert to circulate a proposed response to the DCLG Consultation to Cllrs Bamford, Huddart, Sugden and Way by 30<sup>th</sup> October and send the final response that incorporates comments from Councillors to the Clerk for submission no later than 9<sup>th</sup> November.

**10. To receive a report of the East Area Sub-Committee Meeting**

Tom Swift attended the meeting on Monday 25<sup>th</sup> September. There was one application concerning Claygate (2017/2355 12 Thorne Close). There was a lot of debate on this application. It was decided to defer a decision to the next meeting pending clarification on the plans and elevations, particularly a fence.

**11. To discuss and comment upon any licensing applications in Claygate**

No thing to report.

**12. To discuss and agree action on any enforcement issues**

Cllr Sugden provided an update on 40 Acre Field. The six week period during which the Appellants are entitled to seek a hearing at the High Court expired two days ago on 17<sup>th</sup> October. At the present time it is unknown whether the Appellants have sought a hearing. Cllr Sugden is seeking further advice from Elmbridge Planning Enforcement. If no approach to the High Court has been made, then the Appellants must vacate the site no later than 5<sup>th</sup> December 2017. Cllr Sugden is liaising with Elmbridge Borough Council on enforcement.

**13. To discuss and agree communication of key decisions to residents**

Cllr Sugden provided an update on the Courier. The October 2017 issue has been published and is due to be delivered to residents over the next few days. The copy deadline for articles and associated photos for the next Courier is 11<sup>th</sup> November.

**AP17.** Clerk to schedule an item on the next Agenda for discussion and agreement on articles for the Courier.

**14. Matters for Information Purposes Only.**

None.

**15. To confirm the date of the next meeting and attendance of members Planning Committee:**

**Thursday 9<sup>th</sup> November 2017**

**16. Elmbridge East Area Planning Committee:**

Monday 6<sup>th</sup> November 2017 – Tom Swift to attend

**The meeting closed at 10.50 pm**

**Chairman**

**Date**

## Appendix A

### Planning Applications Decided for weeks ending 29<sup>th</sup> September, 6<sup>th</sup> October & 13<sup>th</sup> October

12 Applications were decided.

These included 1 LDC, 1 Confirmation of Compliance & 1 change of use of premises where there is limited scope for Planning to comment or object.

Planning Committee agreed with EBC on 9 out of 12 decisions.

#### The Applications where we did not agree were:-

2017/2007      26 The Avenue

Additional detached single storey house with rooms in the roofspace and dormer windows following demolition of existing garage

CPC did not object.

EBC refused planning permission on the two grounds. Firstly, the design is awkward and contrived in order to accommodate the roofs. Secondly, as the house would be in a prominent location on a corner plot, it would result in an incongruous and overly dominant feature which would adversely impact on the street scene and character of the area.

2017/2503      1 Telegraph Lane

Part two/part single storey side/rear extension following partial demolition of existing front canopy.

CPC did not object.

EBC refused permission on the grounds that the first floor extension, due to its proximity to the side boundary, lack of setback and location at the prominent corner would result in a dominant, disproportionate and unsympathetic form and proportion of the host building, character and appearance of street scene and further unbalance the pair of semi-detached properties.

2016/2062      Land South of Common Lane/Ruxley Ridge

Retention of existing field shelters to create one structure.

CPC objected.

EBC Planning accepted the recommendation of East Area Sub-Committee and granted approval with the condition that the building be removed after 9 months and land restored within a further three months.

### Appeals Lodge and/or Decided since last Planning Committee Meeting

None