



Caring for Claygate Village

DRAFT
PLANNING COMMITTEE MEETING
held at 8.00pm on Thursday 30th January 2020
Small Hall, Claygate Village Hall

Present: Councillors Geoff Herbert (Chairman), Mark Sugden, Josette Lesser and Janet Swift.
In attendance: Shirley Round (Parish Clerk & RFO), Tom Swift (co-opted) and John Bamford (co-opted)
Tree wardens: Vanessa Relleen, Margie Richardson.

1. **Apologies for absence:**

None
Cllr Woodward did not attend the meeting.

2. **Declarations of Interest in items on the Agenda.**

2.1 To receive declarations of interest from Councillors on items on the agenda.
None

2.2 To received written requests for dispensation for disclosable pecuniary interests (if any):
Cllr Swift submitted a request for dispensation for one year in relation to a future planning application on her property at 1 Hermitage Close.

2.3 To grant any requests for dispensation as appropriate:

The Parish Clerk/Proper Office refused this request following discussion with the Elmbridge Borough Council Monitoring Officer. The request was refused on the grounds that the Councillor's presence during the presentation, discussion and voting process (although it was acknowledged the Councillor would not vote) could exert undue pressure on the Councillors involved in the decision making process. In the event the application on 1 Hermitage Close is subject to objections it could call the integrity of the Parish Council into question if it is seen that Cllr Swift was present during these processes.

3. **To confirm the Minutes of the last meeting**

The Minutes of the meeting on 2nd January 2020 were agreed and signed by the Chairman.

The Chairman, Cllr Herbert, requested a Motion under Standing Orders 1 (a) to allow for information on the EBC consultation document 'Creating our vision, objectives and the direction for development management policies 2020' to be submitted to the Councillors.

8. **Supplementary Planning Documents on Development Contributions & Parking.**

Cllr Sugden stressed the importance of submitting a response to 'Creating our vision, objectives and the direction for development management policies 2020'. This will be the last occasion when comments on the proposed Local Plan can be passed to EBC. This consultation is to seek views of residents and local organisations as part of the preparation of the new Local Plan to replace the Core Strategy Development Management Plan. It is open from 27th January to 9th March 2020.

The questionnaire has been sent to Philippa Jarvis, the Planning Consultant, for her views. The responses to the document will be discussed at the Planning Meeting on 27th February. It was noted that it doesn't mention the Green Belt. An invitation to attend a Local Plan update and Community

Workshop has been received. Cllr Sugden will attend on Thursday 13th February, Cllr Lesser will let the Clerk know if she is available.

7.55 Cllr Wang joined the meeting.

8.05pm Cllr Sugden left the meeting.

4. To report on the actioning of items from previous Minutes.

AP13 Compliance issue – the Roundway. DONE

AP14 Notification of change of meeting times. DONE

5. Planning correspondence, notification of applications and outstanding results

a) Receipt and circulation of the invitation to the EBC local plan update and community workshop.

b) The following notifications of Planning Applications where CPC is a consultee have been received:

2019/3528 3 Meadow Road

2019/3495 1 Stockfield Road

2019/3541 Land adjacent to 14 Elm Road.

2019/3532 Ruxley Lodge, Ruxley Crescent

2019/3204 27 The Roundway

2019/1496 4A Coverts Road (appeal notice)

2019/3602 58 The Roundway

2019/2221 Oaken Lane Mobile Mast (appeal notice)

2019/3565 Hare & Hounds PH

2020/0005 43 Oaken Lane

6. To discuss and comment on applications decided since the last meeting.

A report from John Bamford was circulated prior to the meeting. See Appendix A.

7. Applications from EBC weekly lists including confirmation of comments sent to EBC

Week ending 3rd January

7.1 2019/3528 3 Meadow Road – single-storey rear/side extension incorporating rear pergola and alterations to fenestration following demolition of existing attached garage/utility room.
Claygate Parish Council: No objections. Unanimously agreed.

7.2 2019/3495 1 Stockfield Road – front porch and alterations to roof following demolition of existing front porch.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

7.3 2019/3492 9 Trystings Close – extensions and alterations to convert single-storey dwelling into two-storey dwelling.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Claygate Parish Council note that there is possible overlooking to nos. 32, 34 and 36 Rosehill. Unanimously agreed.

Week ending 10th January

7.4 2019/3532 Ruxley Lodge, Ruxley Crescent – single-storey side extension.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

7.5 2019/3541 Land adjacent to 14 Elm Road – detached two storey building with rooms in the roof space containing 3 flats, dormer windows and associated parking, bin and cycle store.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Could the officer check overlooking to 10 and 12 Oaken Drive, 14, 15 and possibly 16 Elm Road. Unanimously agreed

Week ending 17th January

7.6 2019/3204 27 The Roundway – Additional attached two-storey house with increase in vehicular access following demolition of existing garage and porch.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Claygate Parish Council note the allocated amenity space is small. Unanimously agreed.

- 7.7 2019/3617 15 Hare Lane** – Tree Preservation Order EL 199 – fell x 1 copper beech (T1).
Claygate Parish Council: No objection. This is a beautiful tree in a prominent location and is very important to the street scene. We recognise the request to fell it but ask that there should be a replacement planted which will eventually be an equally impressive tree. We note, however, in the last report in 2017 some improvement in the condition of the tree was noted (appeal decision dated 7th September). Unanimously agreed
- 7.8 2020/0055 Claygate Primary School, Foley Road** – SCC Consultation – permanent retention of a single storey modular building double classroom unit permitted under ref: EL09/0561 dated 3 June 2009 and the permanent retention of a single storey modular building permitted under ref: EL2013/2256 dated 16 July 2013 (2020/0005)
Claygate Parish Council: No comment. Unanimously agreed.
- 7.9 2019/3602 58 The Roundway** – Additional attached one-storey house with room in the roof space, dormer window and ancillary landscaping.
Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

8. Supplementary Planning Documents on Development Contributions and Planning.

Current Consultations:

- i) Creating our vision, objectives and the direction for development management policies 2020:
Open 27th January to 9th March 2020: Awaiting response from Planning Consultant, completion at next Planning Meeting on 27th February.
- ii) SDP Parking
Open 7th January to 4th February:
Detailed comments supplied by John Bamford and agreed unanimously will be forwarded to EBC on 4th February. **AP15**
- iii) SPD Development contributions:
Open 7th January to 4th February 2020: At the meeting the agreed proposal was to amend the word ‘shall’ to ‘must’ in the first sentence of Item 4.24, so that it reads:
*“The size of the development **must** not be artificially reduced in order to reduce or eliminate the affordable housing requirement, for example by sub- dividing sites or reducing the density of whole or part of a site.”* This comment will be forwarded to EBC on 4th February. **AP16**

9. Report on the East Area Sub-Committee Meeting

There were no items for discussion at the meeting on 6th January. There is nothing on the agenda for Claygate on the 3rd February.

10. Licensing applications

No items for Claygate.

11. Compliance issues

- i) Sheds in front gardens: It was agreed the sheds at no 16 and 46 The Roundway will be reported to the officers at EBC Planning Department who will be asked to investigate a possible planning breach.
- ii) Old Bank, 109 Hare Lane: The hoarding in front of the building has now been removed. Request bench and waste bin be re-instated. Clerk to contact EBC **AP17**

12. Communication of key decisions to residents including input to Courier and the website.

Courier due in mid February.

13. Matters for Information Purposes Only.

No items to report.

14. To confirm the date of the next meeting and attendance of members of Planning Committee: Thursday 27th February 2020, 7.30pm, Committee Room, Claygate Village Hall Cllr Wang will confirm his availability.

Elmbridge East Area Planning Committee:
Monday 3rd February and Monday 2nd March 2020.

The meeting closed at 9.35 pm

Chairman:

Dated:

Reserve for the next meeting: Cllr Mark Sugden

Appendix A

Report on Planning Applications Decided since the Last Planning Meeting

20 Applications were decided and Claygate Parish Council (CPC) was a Consultee on 15 of these Applications.

Applications Refused by Elmbridge Borough Council (EBC) were:-

2019/3105: 40 Stevens Lane Claygate Esher Surrey KT10 0TH

Tree Preservation Order EL: 19/10 - Re-Pollard 1 x Poplar (T2) by 7m and 1 x Poplar (T3) by 8m, and crown reduction 1 x Poplar (T4) by 17m.

CPC Objected on the grounds that "These Poplars are significant in the landscape and although in the back garden of the property affect their contribution to the landscape

EBC acknowledged CPC's objection and refused permission stating

"The 17m reduction proposed on T4 in the Councils opinion would foreseeably cause the death of the tree due to the removal of nearly all the tree photosynthetic leaf area and leave huge pruning wounds. This work is well beyond the recommendations set out in BS 3998 2010" and concluded

"In this instance the Council considers the reasons provided insufficient justification for carry out works that would cause foreseeable harm to the health and amenity the trees provide"

2019/3091: Kelmscott Mountview Road Claygate Esher Surrey KT10 0UB

Part two/part single-storey side extension incorporating integral garage, front and rear dormer windows and side roof lights following demolition of existing side canopy.

CPC did not object.

EBC refused permission on the grounds that

"The proximity of the proposed dormer windows within the front elevation to Kelmscott would result in an unacceptable sense of overlooking to the rear garden of the neighbouring property Ruxley Spinney, adversely impacting upon their enjoyment of their private amenity spaces. This is exacerbated by the topography and changes in levels between the neighbouring sites"

2019/3427: 1 Derwent Close Claygate Esher Surrey KT10 0RF

Prior Approval Schedule 2, Part 1, Class A: Single-storey rear extension following demolition of existing conservatory.

EBC refused permission on the grounds that

"the scheme would extend beyond a wall forming a side elevation of the original dwellinghouse, and at 7m would have a width greater than half the width of the original dwellinghouse (13.3m)"

Other Decisions of Note on Applications were:-

2019/3050: 42A The Roundway Claygate Esher Surrey KT10 0DW

Single-storey front extension, front canopy and alterations to roof materials following demolition of existing porch.

CPC did not object but noted that the proposed patio doors would not be in keeping with the street scene.

EBC granted permission and in respect of the patio doors at the front of the house assessed that

“Given the limited visibility of the glazing at the lower level, the glazing still has the appearance of a large window when viewed from the street scene. In light of this, it is considered that the harm is not so severe as to warrant the refusal of the application.

2018/3782: Claygate House Littleworth Road Esher Surrey KT10 9PN

Second floor and third floor extensions to create 15 additional dwellings, alterations to parking layout and alterations to fenestration and finish.

CPC did not object

EBC granted permission subject to 16 conditions that covered issues such as Parking (to be maintained permanently), Method of Construction Statement (with 11 restrictive conditions), Drainage, Balcony Screens (to be maintained permanently), Trees (that must be retained for at least 5 years after first occupation of the building)

2019/3428: Fairoak 2 A Torrington Close Claygate Esher Surrey KT10 0SB

Tree Preservation Order EL:97/28 - T1 Oak - Reduce two low limbs which protrude over car park to rear by 2 metres then reduce and reshape remainder of tree to balance by approximately 1 metre

CPC objected on the grounds that it would spoil the shape of the tree and encourage new growth that would make the tree thicker.

EBC acknowledged CPC's comments and stated that they “agreed to a degree with the representation that the amount of works requested was excessive for the reasons provided”

EBC assessed that “the 3m reduction of the lower tow limbs was excessive and would not leave any real suitable growth points” but was “prepared to accept a 2m reduction of the lower two limbs and a 1m reduction on the remainder of the tree. This would help to alleviate some of the overhang into the car park, while retaining a reasonable natural form to the crown of the tree.”

The revised work specification was accepted and permission was granted to the lesser works.

2019/2593: 6 Station Road Claygate Esher Surrey KT10 9DH

Single-storey rear/side extension.

CPC did not object

EBC noted that “The proposed extension would project by 5m beyond the main rear elevation at No.7 and would breach the 45-degree site line test taken from the edge of the nearest rear facing habitable room; however, given that the height of the proposal would be 2.1m adjacent to the boundary with this neighbouring property and that a 2m high fence can be built under permitted development without the need for express planning permission, the additional 10cms in height is not considered to result in such a degree of harm so as to warrant a refusal on these grounds. The proposed extension would also be positioned to the north of this neighbouring property and the impact in terms of loss of light is likely to be minimal. As such, on balance, the proposal is considered to be acceptable”

Appeals Lodged and/or Decided

2 Appeals were lodged, but none was decided

2019/2221: Oaken Lane Claygate Esher Surrey KT10 0RQ

Prior Approval Schedule 2, Part 16 - Installation of 1No. 20m 'Phase5' street pole, 3No. shrouded antennas, 2No. 0.3m dishes, 3No. equipment cabinets and ancillary development.

At the time of writing no tangible reasons for the Appeal appear to be available

2019/1496: 4A Coverts Road Claygate Esher Surrey KT10 0JU

Single-storey side/rear extension incorporating roof lights following partial demolition of existing conservatory.

The Appeal is based on the proposed extension “only replacing like-for-like due to its poor detrition and poor original roof construction”. Further that it will be “erected on the footprint of partially demolished conservatory which has been in existence for more than 15 years”.

Consequently, the proposal “would not be dominant, visually intrusive nor would it constitute an unneighbourly form of development that would have a harmful impact on the amenity of neighbouring residents” and it “would appear subordinate, sympathetic and congruous to the main building”