

**DRAFT**  
**PLANNING COMMITTEE MEETING**  
**Held at 8.00pm on Thursday 2<sup>nd</sup> March 2017**  
**Committee Room, Claygate Village Hall**

Present: Councillors Geoff Herbert (Chairman), John Bamford, Ken Huddart and Xingang Wang

Co-opted: Tom Swift, Susan Harding

Members of the public: Mr Jonathan Simpkins (re application 2016/4007 129 Hare Lane)

1. **Apologies for absence:** Cllr Julian Way with reasons.

2. **Declarations of Interest in items on the Agenda.**

Cllr Geoff Herbert Co-ordinator of Neighbourhood Watch

Cllr John Bamford Chairman of Friends of Capelfield Surgery, Trustee of Friends of Claygate Day Centre, Trustee of CVHA, Bookkeeper at Holy Name Church, Esher,

Cllr Ken Huddart Chairman of Trustees of CVHA, Presidents of CVA and Acting Chairman of the Claygate Conservation Areas Advisory Committee, Traffic Engineering Consultant, Fellow of Chartered Institution of Highways & Transportation, Fellow of Institution of Engineering & Technology, Fellow of Institution of Civil Engineers.

Cllr Xingang Wang Magistrate and Co-ordinator of Claygate Speed Watch

Susan Harding Business interest in Platform 3, a small pub near Claygate Station.

Tom Swift Resident of Hermitage Close

3. **To confirm the Minutes of the Last Meeting**

The minutes of were 9<sup>th</sup> February 2017 agreed and signed by the Chairman.

*Cllr Herbert requested a change in the order of the Agenda in order to discuss Planning Application 2016/4007 129 Hare Lane.*

Mr. J. Simpkins of 127 Hare Lane expressed concern on the size, bulk and over bearing nature of the extensions planned for 129 Hare Lane. He felt it was out of keeping with the neighbouring houses and would cause a significant loss of light to the back windows and garden of his home.

**7.1 2016/4007 129 Hare Lane** – Part two/part single storey rear extension and single storey front/side extension.

Claygate Parish Council: Object. Out of character to neighbouring properties. Request the officer to check 45deg rule from numbers 125 and 127 Hare Lane. In conflict with Policy DM2 and EBC's SPD Design and Character. Unanimously agreed

4. **To report on the actioning of items from previous Minutes and agree any further action.**

AP23 2016/3753 110 Foley Road. Objection withdrawn. Unanimously agreed. **DONE**

AP 24 16 Holroyd Road. Request under Freedom of Information and letter requesting clarification on matters relating to the planning application. Interim Administrator has responded. **DONE**

AP25 16 Elm Road. Chairman has contacted EBC. **DONE**

5. **To Receive Planning Correspondence and Outstanding Results and Agree Action If Necessary**  
None.

6. **To discuss and comment on applications decided since the last meeting.**

A report was circulated at the meeting. See Appendix A

7. **Applications from EBC weekly lists including confirmation of comments sent to EBC w/ending 10<sup>th</sup> February.**

*Cllr Bamford declared an interest in 2017/0316 as he is known to the applicant.*

7.2 **2017/0316 39 Common Road:** Detached two-storey with rooms in the roofspace and dormer windows comprising 4 flats with associated parking and landscaping following demolition of existing building.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed

7.3 **2017/0350 57 Foley Road:** Non material amendments to planning permission 2016/1898 to increase the size of the rear elevation window.

Claygate Parish Council: No comment. Unanimously agreed

*Cllr Bamford declared an interest in 2017/0233 as he is known to the applicant.*

7.4 **2017/0233** Lavenders, Raleigh Drive: Part two/part single storey front extension incorporating front porch.

Claygate Parish Council: No comment. Unanimously agreed.

*Cllr Bamford and Tom Swift declared an interest in 2017/0152 as they are known to the applicant.*

7.5 **2017/0152** 14 Hermitage Close: Tree preservation order EL258: Crown reduction of 14 hornbeams.

Claygate Parish Council: No comment. Unanimously agreed.

7.6 **2017/0339** 46 Foley Road: Single storey rear extension, single storey side infill extension and alterations to fenestration following demolition of existing garage and rear outbuildings.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Request officer to check 45deg rule from nos 44 and 48 Foley Road. Unanimously agreed.

7.7 **2017/0348 Trinity Cottage, Church Road:** Claygate Conservation Area: fell 1 hornbeam.

Claygate Parish Council: This is an attractive tree within the Conservation Area. It is very important to the street scene, being prominent and highly visible. However, if permission is granted we would request that a suitable and sizeable replacement should be planted.

Unanimously agreed.

**w/ending 17<sup>th</sup> February 2017**

7.8 **2017/0332 Ruxley Mount, Mountview Road:** Single storey rear infill extension, single storey side outbuildings incorporating carport and alternations to fenestration following demolition of existing conservatory.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

7.9 **2017/0345 24 Beaconsfield Road:** Single storey side extension, single storey side extension incorporating front porch, front bay window, side rooflight and alterations to fenestration.

Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Request officer to check 45deg rule from no. 22.

Unanimously agreed.

7.10 **2017/0451 Land north of 37 & 39 Hare Lane:** Variation of condition 2 of planning application 2016/3759 (2 detached houses) to relocate one tree, to remove one tree and alter vehicular access.

Claygate Parish Council: No comment. Unanimously agreed.

- 7.11 **2017/0452 104 Coverts Road:** Lawful Development Certificate. Whether planning permission is required for a proposed hip to gable roof extension incorporating front rooflight and rear dormer window with Juliet balcony.  
Claygate Parish Council: We note permission has already been granted for this application.

**w/ending 24<sup>th</sup> February 2017**

- 7.12 **2016/2986 28 Ruxley Ridge:** Part two/part single storey side/rear extension incorporating two rear juliet balconies and detached garage following demolition of existing single storey side projection.  
Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.
- 7.13 **2017/0549 40 Vale Road:** Single storey rear extension and first floor side extension.  
Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.
- 7.14 **2017/0460 26 Oaken Lane:** Two-storey side/front extension, single storey rear extension and alterations to fenestration following partial demolition of existing house.  
Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.
- 7.15 **2016/3785 30 Common Road:** Part two/part single storey rear extension, front porch and alterations to fenestration following demolition of existing single storey rear extension.  
Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Request officer to check 45deg rule from no. 28.  
Unanimously agreed.
- 7.16 **2016/3644 Broad Oak, The Causeway:** Single storey rear infill, first floor front extension and alterations to fenestration.  
Claygate Parish Council: No objection. Unanimously agreed.

**8. To Discuss and Agree Action on Planning Appeal 2016/1567**

It has been confirmed that Rule 6 Status has been granted for the Claygate Community Group.

**9. To receive a report of the East Area Sub-Committee meeting.**

2016/3063 Ruxley Mount, new detached house replacing garage. Alex and Kim were happy with the view, and CPC raised no objection. Permitted with removal of permitted development rights, Class A.

2016/3586 16 Holroyd Road, conversion of house into two flats. Since the previous application had been refused (and objected to by the PCC) solely on the absence of an affordable contribution, which had now been bypassed by a viability appraisal and reduction of the proposal from three to two flats, by removing a previously proposed extension, there was no way in which EBC would refuse the application. Alex had declared an interest and agreed with legal services to be correct to speak at some length. Concerns related to the very cramped design (inadequate for national interior space standards), inadequate width to move the bins through the side passages, and the impossibility of moving the street light (but this is an engineering matter for SCC). So it was permitted without opposition.

2016/4028. 12 Woodbourne Drive, front and rear extensions, 1 and 2 storey. Although the present proposal is much reduced compared with the past, CPC still objected on grounds of being overbearing and intrusive on neighbours front and rear. In moving permission, Alex said this was now the absolute limit of extension, so permitted development rights (Class B, roofs, only) were removed.

**10. To Discuss and Comment Upon Any Licensing Applications in Claygate.**

None

**11. To Discuss and Agree Action On Any Enforcement Issues**

None

**12. To Discuss and Agree Communication of Key Decisions to Residents**

Nothing to add

**13. Matters for Information Purposes Only.**

- a) Cllr Herbert reported the EBC Draft Local Plan questionnaire had been submitted and that a copy had been circulated to all Councillors and co-opted members of the Planning Committee.
- b) The Interim Administrator circulated a copy of an open letter sent to Sajid Javid (Secretary of State for Communities & Local Government) from Stuart Selleck Council Leader of EBC (Residents' Association), Andrew Davis deputy Council Leader EBC (Liberal Democrats) and Tim Oliver leader of the Opposition EBC (Conservatives) and printed in the Surrey Advertiser. This letter related to the new Local Plan that was required to be reassessed as a result of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF). Firstly, it sought clarification on Green Belt in the light of recent comments from the Secretary of State. Secondly, it sought guidance about funding for infrastructure required to support additional housing and timescales for delivery of housing assessed within the new Local Plan as a result of a recent housing white paper.

**14. To Confirm the Dates of the Next Meeting and Attendance of Members Planning Committee:**

Thursday 23<sup>rd</sup> March 2017

**15. Elmbridge East Area Planning Committee:**

Monday 13<sup>th</sup> March – Tom Swift to attend.

**The meeting closed at 9.45 pm**

**Chairman**

**Date**

## Appendix A

### Planning Applications Decided for weeks ending 10<sup>th</sup>, 17<sup>th</sup> & 24<sup>th</sup> February

12 Applications were decided.

4 were either Non Material Amendments or Variations of Conditions for Approved Plans

1 was for a TPO.

The Planning Committee agreed with EBC on 9 out of 12 decisions.

The Application where we did not agree was:-

2016/4004: 9 Simmil Road Claygate Esher Surrey KT10 ORT

Part two/part single storey rear extension and alterations to fenestration following demolition of existing rear outbuilding

CPC did not object, but requested EBC to check 45% rule to No 8.

EBC refused permission on the following grounds

- Steep mono-pitched roof design would appear as an incongruous feature that would fail to integrate with the rest of the property and appear out of character
- Choice of external materials, namely render, would exacerbate the out of character appearance

2016/3586: 16 Holroyd Road

Part two/part single storey side/rear extension, side rooflight and alterations to fenestration following demolition of existing garage to create 2 flats

CPC supported the EBC Officer's Report (from the previous Application) that recommended refusal on grounds of failure to provide off-site affordable contribution.

East Area Elmbridge Sub-Committee accepted that the Viability Appraisal submitted with this Application (that was independently checked) provided justifiable grounds for non-payment of the off-site affordable contribution. Therefore there were no longer grounds for refusal.

2016/4028: 12 Woodbourne Drive

Part two/part single storey side/rear extension, single storey front extension incorporating entrance porch and alterations to fenestration following demolition of existing single storey side extension, rear conservatory and front porch

CPC objected on the grounds that the development would have an overbearing impact on neighbours and lead to loss of light and overshadowing.

East Area Elmbridge Sub-Committee accepted that the Officer's recommendation that permission is granted. The reduction in height (1.8m), width (2.2m) and depth (0.4m) reduces the overbearing impact. The loss of sunlight and overshadowing was acknowledged, but not deemed to be sufficient to warrant refusal.

### **Appeals Decided since last Planning Committee Meeting**

2016/2252: 13 Brookfield Gardens

Ground Floor rear extension, front porch, revised vehicular hardstanding

Appeal was dismissed in respect of the rear extension, but granted for the front porch and vehicular hardstanding.

Appeal concluded that the single storey rear extension would be harmful to the living conditions of neighbouring properties. This would be in conflict with Policy DM2, advice provided in EBC's Supplementary Planning Document "Design & Character" and relevant advice in National Planning Policy Framework.

The Appeal acknowledged that under Permitted Development a single storey extension up to a maximum of 3m could be built up to the boundary with No 15 – the full width extension would be stepped back to 3m along the common boundary with No 13 & No 15. However, the extension would appear overbearing and impact adversely on No 15 in that light entry would be restricted as a consequence.

CPC objected quoting policy DM2. CPC also objected to the front porch on the grounds that it was moving forward from the building line.

### **Appeals Lodged since last Planning Committee Meeting**

#### **2016/2140 - Pear Tree House 35 Red Lane Claygate**

Two-storey side extension with juliet balcony following demolition of existing garage

CPC objected, but on the "tree grounds". EBC withdrew their objection on tree grounds after a subsequent consultation document was provided, but refused planning permission on the grounds that "The proposed development would unacceptably imbalance the existing semi-detached pair of houses and appear incongruous with existing houses ....."