

These are draft minutes and are subject to approval at the next meeting.



PLANNING COMMITTEE MEETING
8.00pm on Thursday 12 March 2015
Village Hall Committee Room

Minutes.

Present: *Councillors:* Noel Isaacs (*Chairman*), Alex Coomes, Ken Huddart, Mark Sugden (*ex-officio*)
Co-opted Members: Tom Swift, Susan Harding
Parish Clerk: Freda Collins
2 members of the public

Cllr Coomes was not at the start of the meeting.

1. Apologies for Absence

Michael O'Brien with reason.

2. Declarations of Interests

Cllr Huddart declared that he is Acting-Chairman of the Claygate Conservation Areas Advisory Committee.

3. Minutes of last meeting

The minutes of 19 Feb 2015 were approved and signed.

4. Report of actioning of items from previous minutes

Vanessa has been in contact with the Tree Council and she and Margie have begun the process to get ID.

5. Correspondence

None

Cllr Coomes arrived at the meeting.

6. Current applications and Declarations of interest

Applications from week ending – 20 Feb 2015

6.1 2015/0428– 14, Foley Road –*single storey rear extension and alterations to fenestration following demolition of existing conservatory.*

We are not objecting, but require the proposed materials to be in keeping with the property and surrounding properties in accordance with CS11, CS16. We ask the Officer to check the new windows requiring obscured glazing.

6.2 2015/0562– 110, Foley Road–*CCC: 3 (Material Samples), 6 (Additional Tree Information) and 8 (Parking and Turning) of permission 2014/1061*

No comment.

6.3 2015/0354– 110, Foley Road—*Variation of Condition 2 (Approved Plans) of permission 2014/1061 for changes to fenestration, to add decorative roof tiles and change to flat roof on entrance canopy.*

No comment.

6.4 2015/0570 -2, Fitzalan Road-*LDC: whether permission is required for the proposed conversion of the existing garage into habitable accommodation.*

We are not objecting, but ask the Officer to clarify if this is an LDC or whether it requires planning permission.

6.5 2015/0234- 52 & 58, Red Lane –*TPO EL:02/14-fell Wellingtonia and cedar in rear garden of no. 52 and fell cedar in rear garden of no. 58*

The application is to fell a Wellingtonia and a cedar in the garden of 52 Red Lane, and to fell another cedar in the garden of 58 Red Lane, claiming that these trees are causing subsidence at 48 Red Lane.

These are draft minutes and are subject to approval at the next meeting.

The giant Wellingtonia is approximately 250 years old and is a historic landmark tree of great significance. It can be seen from many parts of Claygate. It is a perfectly healthy tree. Equally both the cedars are large and important trees in the landscape and are in good condition.

The evidence does not seem to be sufficiently strong that any particular one of these three trees is the one that is causing the problem and so we object to these proposals.

In the absence of compelling and robust evidence we urge that the Council gets its own expert advice and adopts a very conservative approach to any felling of these historic and beautiful trees.

6.6 2015/0255– 25, Dalmore Avenue—*detached two storey house with rooms in the roofspace, dormer window and new access following demolition of existing house.*

No comment.

6.7 2015/0408 – 40, Oaken Lane—*part two/ part single storey rear extension following demolition of existing conservatory.*

We are not objecting but ask the Officer to check the 45 degree rule to number 42.

Applications from week ending – 27 Feb 2015

6.8 2015/0673 – 3, Stockfield Road—*two storey side extension incorporating garage and single storey rear extension following demolition of existing side/rear extension and garage*

We are not objecting to this application but ask the Officer to check the 1m clearance to the boundary at the side of the proposed two storey extension.

6.9 2015/0426 – 59, Foley Road—*2m high front boundary fence*

We object to the proposal as the house is in a Conservation Area; it is in a prominent position and this will fundamentally affect the street scene, contrary to CS11. This house is locally listed.

6.10 2015/0718 – Brackenwood, Hillview Road- LDC: *whether permission is required for a proposed single storey side/rear extension.*

We do not believe this is an LDC, as it incorporates a side extension. We note the virtually identical plans as submitted in a full planning application ref: 2014/5000 were refused by Elmbridge Borough Council on 12/02/2015. We believe all the points as listed by the Officer in the previous refusal, “the harmful effect on the neighbouring property Ruxley House due to loss of light to a habitable window and overbearing impact”, remain the same and are all still pertinent to the LDC.

6.11 2015/0406– 59, Foley Road—*single storey front infill extension and alterations to fenestration*

No comment.

Applications from week ending – 6 Mar 2015

6.12 2015/0625– Kybo, Ruxley Crescent—*two storey front extension, 1.7m increase in roof height to facilitate an increase in first floor eaves height and second floor accommodation within roofspace, first floor rear balcony, new front entrance porch and alterations to fenestration.*

No comment.

6.13 2015/0877– 31, St Leonards Road—*LDC: whether permission is required for a proposed hip to gable roof extension incorporating rear dormer window and side rooflight.*

No comment

6.14 2015/0793– 7, Langbourne Way—*single storey rear extension*

No comment

6.15 2015/0505 – 3, Foley Road—*detached two storey house with rooms in roofspace, basement and new access following demolition of existing house*

No comment.

6.16 2015/703– Co-operative Retail Services, 109A, Hare Lane—*new shop front and 3 air conditioning units at rear*

No comment

These are draft minutes and are subject to approval at the next meeting.

6.17 **2015/0747– 17, St Leonards Road**—*detached double garage with rooms above incorporating front dormer windows and mezzanine floor following demolition of existing garage*
No comment.

6.18 **2015/0633- 5, Oaken Lane**—*detached two storey house with rooms in roofspace following demolition of existing house*
No comment.

Since the last meeting, an EBC Tree Officer, Rob Toll, wanted to speak about the comments submitted about 2014/4221 19 Tower Gardens- various tree works. CPC Tree Wardens have been in contact with him. The applicant has provided some extra information but the application still lacks clarity and the reasons for the proposed work are not given in a significant number of cases. The Tree Officer has visited the site and after inspection of the trees he is minded to object to all the work with the exception of T2 sweet chestnut (fell) and T7 hawthorn (fell), which he would allow. The comments of the Tree Wardens are as follows:

T2 sweet chestnut: fell

This is a young tree but it probably has a limited life expectancy because of its position and shape.
No comment.

T3 sycamore: fell

The applicant has added "final canopy 5 metres" as extra information.
This is a young and healthy tree.
Object.

T4 Holly: reduce

The applicant has added "final canopy 4 metres" as additional information.
No reason has been given for the work.
Object

T5/6 yew trees: trim and reduce

The applicant has added "final canopy 6 metres" as additional information but given no reason for the work.
Object

T7 Hawthorn: fell

Although the application does not give a reason for this the tree is not in very good condition.
No comment.

T8 yew tree: reduce and shape

The application has added "final canopy 6 metres" but given no reason for the work.
Object

T9, T10 and T11 the application is to reduce these three trees (2yew trees and a beech). Final canopy measurements have been given in each case but no reasons given for the work.
The reduction is significant in each case.
Object

T12 Oak.

The applicant has given the additional information "Check yearly"
No comment.

It was agreed that these comments should be passed to the EBC Officer.

7. Report of the East Area Sub Committee

Cllr Huddart attended this meeting and circulated the following report:-

2015/0082 2 Foley Road -*single/two story side/rear extension, side porch, rear dormer window.*
Refused *nem con* after a long debate.

CPC had objected to the design and materials being out of keeping with the existing house, and very visible from the rec., but the officer's report "considered" that the objections were acceptable Alex Coomes, Geoff

These are draft minutes and are subject to approval at the next meeting.

Herbert and Mary Marshall were present, raised many points and moved for refusal. The key issue was whether the Planning Inspectorate would accept a refusal on grounds, which had not been raised previously. The previous application was refused at officer level, purely for an out-of-keeping front gable and two-storey extension, which had been omitted from the current application. The objections now raised were the side /rear extension depriving the neighbour of light to a hallway, which was used as a craft room, and of the size and zinc finish of the proposed rear dormer window; the inadequate amenity space was unchanged by the proposal. It was noted that the zinc finish could be dealt with in a condition, so was not a good reason for refusal. The reasons cited (by Alex) were HSG16, HASG20 (light), ENV2, CS17 and CS11.

8. Licensing Applications

None.

9. Enforcement

Cllr Isaacs sent an updated report on all enforcement issues prior to the PC meeting. She has also been in contact with Steve Elliott of EBC.

The following are outstanding:-

- i. 1 Caerleon Close *Retrospective Variation of condition on enlarged footprint.* This was refused, but another application has now been submitted. This will now go to EA Sub. Remedial work is required on the garage. If this is not undertaken before completion of the work it will become an enforcement issue.
- ii. 66, Hare Lane-*Fence to road frontage too high.* The plans are in the validation section.
- iii. 15, Gordon Road-*Application whether roof extension permissible under LDC (a retrospective application).* It is believed that the applicant will not go to appeal but is looking at ways of solving the problem.
- iv. 14, Red Lane- *Retrospective planning application for fence to rear of garden backing onto Hermitage Close.* The enforcement letter has been sent.
- v. Wyevale Site- *planting.* A set of plans were reviewed at the 19 Feb meeting and comments passed onto EBC. We await the planning officer’s decision.
- vi. 4A, Coverts Road -*Fence encroaching by over a metre into CRGT land.* This has been reported and investigation reference given.

Prior to the next discussion, Cllrs Coomes and Sugden declared an interest as they are Trustees of the Recreation Ground.

It was reported that other residents backing onto the Recreation Ground have moved their boundary fences and may be encroaching onto land owned by EBC. Enforcement has been notified. Tom Swift has been looking into this matter, using photos obtained from Google showing the original boundaries. He and Cllr Isaacs will arrange a meeting with the Enforcement Officer about this issue. Thanks were given to Tom for his good work.

10. 40 Acre Field

We continue to monitor this on a weekly basis and to keep a running diary. Ongoing.

11. Matters for information only

It has been noted that some houses in Holroyd Road may be infringing on Claygate Common with compost areas. Cllr Isaacs and Susan Harding will make a site visit and report back.

12. Date of next meetings

CPC Planning Meeting

Thursday 2 Apr 2015–Village Hall Committee Room

Elmbridge Sub-Committee

Mon 23 Mar	- MO
Mon 13 Apr	- TS

.....ChairmanDate

These are draft minutes and are subject to approval at the next meeting.